

Village of Bellaire

ADMINISTRATION AND PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

Dan Bennett, Chairman

Dave Ciganick

Bryan Hardy

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

January 7, 2020

7:30 a.m.

1. **Call to Order:** Chairman Bennett called the meeting to order at 7:32 a.m.
2. **Attendance**
 - Members Present:** Chairman Bennett, Trustee Ciganick, and Trustee Hardy
 - Members Absent:** None
 - Staff Present:** Lori Lockett, Clerk; Cathy Odom, Treasurer; Bill Drollinger, Police Chief; and Bradley Keiser, DPW Supervisor
 - Others Present:** None
3. **Approval of Agenda:** There were two additions to the agenda under New Business; Item 3) Disciplinary Forms and Item 4) Letter of Resignation. The agenda was approved as amended.

Motion by Trustee Hardy, seconded by Chairman Bennett, to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried by voice vote.
4. **Approval of Minutes:** The Administration & Personnel Committee minutes of the November 19, 2019 meeting were approved as presented.

Motion by Trustee Hardy, seconded by Trustee Ciganick, to approve the minutes of the November 19, 2019 meeting as presented. Motion carried by voice vote.
5. **Public Comment on Agenda Items:** None presented.
6. **Old Business:**
 - a) **Employee Evaluations:** Chairman Bennett stated that he had spent hours reviewing and tabulating the evaluations. He explained the process that will be used. He believes that the evaluations need to be tailored to respective positions so that employees are evaluated on the relevant skills. Trustee Hardy suggested that the employee evaluations could be modified for next year. Trustee Ciganick suggested that it was difficult to evaluate staff because of minimal contact. Chief Drollinger thought it was a good idea to evaluate staff using the job descriptions and specific skills. Chairman Bennett requested that staff leave the room for a brief time for the committee to review the evaluation materials. During this time, Chairman Bennett explained the materials and the scoring noting that certain employees consistently underrate their performance. The scores reflect that employees are meeting expectations and doing their jobs. The four “administrative” employees will be reviewed with the committee. DPW employees and the Public Safety employee will be reviewed with the supervisor and one committee member. There was brief discussion about the score range and percentage of bonus. Staff was requested to return to the meeting. After brief discussion it was decided that evaluations of four employees will be done in 15-minute increments and scheduled at a later date.
7. **New Business**
 - a) **Personnel Matters**
 - 1) **Definition of Full-Time:** Clerk Lockett explained that the updated employee handbook prompted a question about the definition of full-time. The village currently considers 40 hours full-time and part-time less than 40

**VILLAGE OF BELLAIRE
ADMINISTRATION AND PERSONNEL COMMITTEE**

hours. FLSA does not define full-time. The Affordable Care Act considers 35 hours to be full-time. Treasurer Odom noted that the current handbook correctly addresses full-time and the calculation of time for overtime pay. Trustee Hardy recounted the system used at the resort. Trustee Ciganick asked if the 40 hours affected anything other than overtime. Treasurer Odom noted that it established eligibility for benefits.

2) Comp Time: Treasurer Odom explained that there are two conflicting provisions in the handbook. One section says that comp time must be used within three pay periods; the other section says it must be used by the end of the fiscal year. Trustee Ciganick noted that comp time could be used for extra vacation days and that a vacation time request is granted by the supervisor. Treasurer Odom explained that employees could request comp time at the end of the year, leaving a department short-staffed. Chief Drollinger explained that with the three-pay period requirement, he had to take a day off when he had work to do. He would like to be able to have until the end of the year. Trustee Ciganick asked about the supervisor's latitude in determining when an employee gets his comp time. If it is allowed to accumulate until the end of the year, an employee could have a month. Chief Drollinger noted that in using his comp time, he has requested to be allowed to carry over paid leave. Treasurer Odom cautioned that carrying over paid leave has to be for a good reason. She provided the example when she was the only staff in the office for several months. Trustee Ciganick said the idea of vacation is to get out of the office. Use or lose it forces the employees to relax and recharge. Staff explained that there have only been a few employees who have used comp time. Most opt for the overtime pay. Trustee Ciganick expressed his preference for the end of the year; extending paid leave has to be for a good reason. Use of comp time by the end of the fiscal year was recommended to council

Motion by Trustee Ciganick, seconded by Trustee Hardy, to recommend to village council that the employee handbook be changed to reflect that, instead of being used within three pay periods, comp time shall be used by the end of the fiscal year as stated elsewhere in the employee handbook. Motion carried by voice vote.

3) Disciplinary Forms: Supervisor Keiser explained that shortly after he took over as supervisor, there were a couple of employee issues that prompted President Schulz to come to him about developing disciplinary forms. President Schulz drafted the forms, sent them to Supervisor Keiser, and intended that the forms be reviewed by the Administration and Personnel Committee. The draft forms were never reviewed by the committee. Chairman Bennett stated that he wants the supervisor to establish a paper trail if disciplining an employee. Trustee Ciganick asked if the employees were at-will and whether the forms were contrary to at-will employment. Is there a multiple warning system? Trustee Ciganick likes the idea of documenting but cautioned that a third party be involved. Clerk Luckett noted that the employee handbook outlined the disciplinary procedures and that it had been reviewed by legal counsel. According to Supervisor Keiser, the forms were drafted to reflect the procedure outlined in the handbook. Employee contracts indicated that employees are at-will. Clerk Luckett read the pertinent provisions of the handbook for the committee. There was discussion about the number of violations and whether they expired or could be expunged. Chief Drollinger explained that police department employee files follow the officers. He thinks that there should be a time frame on minor infractions so that they can be removed from the file. Chairman Bennett agreed that there should be a time limit. Trustee Ciganick suggested that the three-warning system did not obligate termination of employment. To expunge them does not seem necessary. Based on current events in the news, there was brief discussion about whether criminal accusations meant an employee had to be placed on unpaid leave versus paid leave. The forms were reviewed. Trustee Ciganick made a motion to recommend adoption of the Employee Warning Record with a requirement that a third party be present.

Motion by Trustee Ciganick, seconded by Trustee Hardy, to recommend to village council the adoption of the Employee Warning Record with a requirement that a third party be present. Motion carried by voice vote.

4) Letter of Resignation: Supervisor Keiser explained that Eric Shumaker has accepted a position out of state and has tendered his resignation effective January 24, 2020. Supervisor Keiser also noted that he had been kept fully apprised through the process. A motion to recommend acceptance of Eric Shumaker's resignation was made. A second motion was made to recommend to council to post the position that has been created by Eric's departure.

**VILLAGE OF BELLAIRE
ADMINISTRATION AND PERSONNEL COMMITTEE**

Motion by Trustee Ciganick, seconded by Trustee Hardy, to recommend to village council that they accept Eric Shumaker's resignation. Motion carried by voice vote.

Motion by Trustee Ciganick, seconded by Trustee Hardy, to recommend to village council to post the position that has been created by Eric's departure. Motion carried by voice vote.

b) Budget Items:

1) Merit Pay: Treasurer Odom reported that this item was placed on the agenda in the event the committee was ready. The committee will have to determine whether to award merit pay and the percentage amounts for merit raises. Chairman Bennett explained that he was upset with the ranges because of the way employees had responded. According to Chairman Bennett, many employees rated their own performance lower. Treasurer Odom suggested that the first thing to do was to get through the evaluations.

2) Health Insurance: Treasurer Odom reported that the insurance cost increased this year by 11.68%. Last year the rates increased 2%; the year prior a little higher. The insurance agent is putting together options and costs for the committee to consider. Once Treasurer Odom receives the information it will be input into the budget. Trustee Ciganick noted that in discussions with his wife and her employment he has advocated for holding on to current insurance; it's like an automatic increase. Treasurer Odom expressed her preference for insurance over merit pay and cost of living. Chairman Bennett recited the range of employee evaluation scores. Current cost of living is 2.3 or .38. Village council has voted to establish the applicable cost of living. Trustee Ciganick would like to see the fixed number of insurance cost for the insurance before looking at pay increases. If employees are happy with the insurance, do not mess with it. Trustee Ciganick suggested that there might be cost savings measures that could affect health insurance.

8. Discussion Items: Chairman Bennett explained that he had learned about an outdoor public art program through the Detroit Institute of Arts. He will provide the information to the Parks Committee for review and possible development of a public art policy. The next Administration and Personnel Committee meeting is scheduled for Thursday, January 9, 2020. Administrative employee performance evaluations will be conducted.

9. Communications/Informational: None presented.

10. Member/Public Comment: None presented.

11. Adjourn: Motion to adjourn by Chairman Bennett supported by Trustee Ciganick. The meeting was adjourned at 8:34 a.m.

Minutes compiled by:
Lori Lockett, Clerk
Minutes are subject to approval.

Approved: _____

Date: _____