

Village of Bellaire

ADMINISTRATION AND PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

Dan Bennett, Chairman

Dave Ciganick

Bryan Hardy

COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

November 19, 2019

7:30 a.m.

1. **Call to Order:** Chairman Bennett called the meeting to order at 7:30 a.m.
2. **Attendance**
 - Members Present:** Chairman Bennett, Trustee Ciganick and Trustee Hardy
 - Members Absent:** None
 - Staff Present:** Lori Luckett, Clerk, Bradley Keiser, DPW Supervisor and Cathy Odom, Treasurer
 - Others Present:** None
3. **Approval of Agenda:** The agenda was approved as presented.
Motion by Trustee Hardy, seconded by Trustee Ciganick, to approve the agenda as presented. Motion carried by voice vote.
4. **Approval of Minutes:** The minutes of the August 27, 2019 meeting were approved as presented.
Motion by Trustee Hardy, seconded by Chairman Bennett, to approve the minutes of the August 27, 2019 meeting as presented. Motion carried by voice vote.
5. **Public Comment on Agenda Items:** None presented.
6. **Old Business:** None presented.
7. **New Business**
 - a) **Employee Evaluations:** Clerk Luckett reported that the three evaluation forms were at their places, the Peer Review, Self-Review and Performance Review by Supervisor. The question is whether the Peer Review should continue. Chairman Bennett stated that a question has come up because several employees think that the Peer Review is a “joke” and has been misused in the past. Chairman Bennett indicated that he has never been a real fan of peer evaluation; he would rather have other things but there is no time to develop them. Trustee Hardy agreed that reviews should be done “the old-fashioned way”; self and supervisor. Trustee Ciganick asked how the Peer Review was a joke? Supervisor Keiser reported that it has been used to get back at employees, sometimes for non-work-related actions. One employee wrote N/A on the review last year. Employee comments that something will be reflected in another’s peer review are not funny. Trustee Hardy recounted the process at his previous employer in Central Lake. There was always an HR person in attendance to differentiate between relevant and other matters. Because the performance reviews are linked to merit pay, someone giving a bad peer review has a negative impact on another’s potential merit pay. Clerk Luckett noted there was also the situation that no matter how poor a person’s job performance was, merit pay was still given. The perception was the comments were not taken seriously if the person whose performance was so poor, still received merit pay. There were sentiments that employees were not being

**VILLAGE OF BELLAIRE
ADMINISTRATION AND PERSONNEL COMMITTEE**

listened to on one hand and, that a bad day could be reflected in a snarky comment in a peer review that was not indicative of an employee's performance the balance of the year. Trustee Ciganick wondered if this same feeling would prevail. Supervisor Keiser reported that the consensus at the shop is to get rid of the Peer Review; mostly from the standpoint of one person making comments that drag all scores down. Trustee Ciganick did not disagree with the elimination of the Peer Review. The Administration and Personnel Committee members will review the Police Chief, Clerk, Treasurer and DPW Supervisor. Supervisor Keiser will review DPW employees, Chief Drollinger will review Officer McBee. There was discussion about the time frame for completion of the reviews. Chairman Bennett asked about the calculation of merit pay. Supervisor Keiser and Clerk Luckett indicated that a formula had been developed. Merit pay is awarded if there are funds in the budget. There was brief discussion about the forms and an area for identifying self-improvement. Supervisor Keiser reported on department goals and training in the water and sewer departments. DPW employees are taking water classes and sewer classes. Two employees have been doing a lot of work in the sewer department. Once an employee has enough hours an examination and certification are required. According to Supervisor Keiser, eventually everyone will be certified. Two employees attended lagoon classes. Hopefully one will be certified this spring. Chairman Bennett requested a motion to recommend elimination of Peer Review this round during the evaluations. Motion by Trustee Hardy supported by Trustee Ciganick.

Motion by Trustee Hardy, seconded by Trustee Ciganick, to recommend to village council the elimination of Peer Review this round during the evaluations. Motion carried by voice vote.

Chairman Bennett asked Treasurer Odom if there were concerns with the upcoming budget. Treasurer Odom expressed concern about Sewer Fund. Local Streets and Water are okay. While Water has had a rough year, there is a healthy fund balance. Trustee Ciganick asked about the fund balance amount. Is there a standard for fund balance for municipalities of our size? Treasurer Odom stated the minimum is 10%. Major Streets Fund is better now that the snow removal contract is directly with the state. The state recommended that we contract directly with them. Under the previous arrangement, the county subcontracted with the village and retained 50% of the contract amount. Because the state required the county to maintain standards i.e. clearing intersections along M-88 that already had been cleared by the village, the county decided to no longer hold the contract.

Discussion returned to employee evaluations. Self and Supervisor Evaluations will be distributed to employees to be returned after the December village council meeting. The merit percentage amount will be determined by the Committee. There was brief discussion about the evaluation review and comment section. The committee will prepare the summary. Staff asked whether the whole council should see the evaluations? Chairman Bennett stated that arrangements could be made. Clerk Luckett noted that the Employee Handbook mentions the review and delegates it to the Administration and Personnel Committee. There was discussion about the need to amend the handbook. Trustee Ciganick made the motion to recommend to village council that if Peer Review is in place in the Employee Handbook, the Handbook be amended to eliminate Peer Review.

Motion by Trustee Ciganick, seconded by Trustee Hardy, to recommend to village council that if Peer Review is in place in the Employee Handbook, the Handbook be amended to eliminate Peer Review. Motion carried by voice vote.

**VILLAGE OF BELLAIRE
ADMINISTRATION AND PERSONNEL COMMITTEE**

- 8. Discussion Items:** There was brief comment about Chris Gryna putting up Christmas garland dressed like Buddy the Elf. Chairman Bennett asked about the deer problem in the village. Supervisor Keiser reported there were 24 deer around the DPW garage. Deer have been in gardens, on patios and porches in the village. General consensus is that the community would not support culling the deer population. A bear has also been seen between the two treatment ponds. The DNR can move the bears however, it is expensive.

- 9. Communications/Informational:** Soup cook-off tickets are available. Community Huddle is tonight at ASI. Trustee Ciganick is seeking bell ringers for a Salvation Army donation station at Family Fare. There was brief discussion about the difficulty in getting students involved in extracurricular activities. A comment was made that meals at the Senior Center have been delicious. Administration and Personnel will meet once all budget items are in. The health insurance and taxable value amounts are available around the first of the year.

- 10. Member/Public Comment:** None presented.

- 11. Adjourn:** Motion to adjourn by Trustee Hardy supported by Trustee Ciganick. The meeting was adjourned at 8: 15 a.m.

Minutes compiled by:
Lori A. Lockett, Clerk
Minutes are subject to approval.

Approved: _____

Date: _____