

# Village of Bellaire

## ADMINISTRATION & PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

Dan Bennett, Chairman

Dave Ciganick

Bryan Hardy

### COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

October 3, 2022

8:00 AM

**I. Call to Order:** Meeting was called to order at 8:00 AM

**II. Roll Call - Attendance:**

**Present:** Bryan Hardy, Dave Ciganick, and Dan Bennett

**Absent:** None

**Staff Present:** Nicole Essad, Clerk; Cathy Odom, Treasurer; Bradley Keiser, DWP Supervisor; and Bill Drollinger, Police Chief

**Public Present:** None

**III. Approval of Agenda:** The agenda was approved as presented.

**Motion by Hardy, seconded by Ciganick to approve the agenda as presented. Motion Passed by unanimous voice vote.**

**IV. Approval of Minutes – January 31, 2022 and May 19, 2022:** The minutes of the January 31, 2022 and May 19, 2022 meetings were approved as presented.

**Motion by Bennett, seconded by Hardy to approve the minutes of the January 31, 2022 and May 19, 2022 meetings as presented. Motion Passed by unanimous voice vote.**

**V. Conflict of Interest:** None presented.

**VI. Public Comment:** None presented.

**VII. Old Business:** None presented.

**VIII. New Business**

- a. Pre Budget/ Pay Scale:** Chairperson Bennett stated that there was concern by some on the Council that the Village can keep its valued employees and the Village needs to look at what it pays. Trustee Hardy stated that he believes that the Council is being proactive because it is a crazy world with the inflation index at 8.1%. He stated that jobs at McDonalds are paying \$20-\$21 per hour. He stated that if the DPW loses one more person then that department cannot do all its jobs. He asked if the Village could afford to contract out for snow removal if it came down to it. Trustee Ciganick clarified that the jobs at McDonalds are up to \$21 per hour and the Village offers good benefits. He also believes that the Village needs to raise its base rate, with all other steps following. He stated that the Village has to be aware that they have to pay for the

# Village of Bellaire

## ADMINISTRATION & PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

**Dan Bennett, Chairman**

**Dave Ciganick**

**Bryan Hardy**

raises somehow. He stated that the Village cannot take less out of its profits to pay its employees. He stated that the Village is “fixed income” and can only pay out what is coming in. He went on to explain that he thought that water and sewer are a priority and then roads, then public safety, but the Village is not required to have a public safety department. He also stated that parks and cemetery are lower on the priority list as well. Trustee Ciganick stated that before the Village does any big projects it needs to take care of its staff and infrastructure. Chairperson Bennett stated that the reason the Village has the staff it does are the benefits not the pay. He suggested that the pay scale should be three steps. He stated that this would allow people to get to the top faster than they can now. He then suggested some type of longevity pay/benefit. He also suggested hiring the part time mowing at the DPW to plow snow while one of the other guys cannot. Chairperson Bennett stated that the adjustment to a three-step wage scale can be made for the next fiscal year. He also suggested giving a benefit to employees getting training/certificates and making sure they stay with the Village after getting it. DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that the Village covers the training and certification processes. He also suggested that an extra \$1 per hour for having a water license and an extra \$1 per hour for having the sewer license would be a good idea. Trustee Ciganick asked is having the sewer plant operations contracted out is better in the long run. DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that in the long run it would cost the Village more, but for now while the Village is trying to get everything right with EGLE that it is good to have them here. Trustee Ciganick asked if the Village was in the hunt for a wastewater treatment operator with the hourly rates it has now. DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that no. He stated that the person would have to be someone very new to wastewater operations or they would have to be trained in house. General discussion was held about training for the sewer treatment plant and what license will be needed when everything is all done. Trustee Ciganick suggested a dual rate: one for wastewater treatment and another for DPW work, and that if the Village puts the employee through the education to get a license, then have a contract signed that the employee will stay for five years. DPW Supervisor Keiser suggested doing the same contract for the water license, which is way more a week and month than sewer. Trustee Ciganick stated that in the past the wage scale was increased by the cost of living, but what the Committee is talking about now is to increase the wage scale to something in addition to the cost-of-living. Chairperson Bennett stated that if the employees do not get at least the cost-of-living increase then it is subsidizing the Village. He asked staff for their input. DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that the longevity benefit is the vacation time. General discussion was held about the atmosphere of working at the Village, and how somewhat flexible schedules can be. Chief Drollinger stated that Officer McBee would like to make more money, but he understands that he is treated well, and the Village is a nice place to work because of the benefits and flexibility. Chief Drollinger stated that several officers have moved to the county, but they have regretted that decision even though they make more money. Chairperson Bennett asked what the Village can do to benefit staff that would not cost

# Village of Bellaire

## ADMINISTRATION & PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

Dan Bennett, Chairman

Dave Ciganick

Bryan Hardy

money. Chief Drollinger stated that the Council is already doing it. He stated that the Council is good to work for and the employees understand the budget, and know things are tight. He stated that there is a recession, and this is not the first time the Village has been here. He stated that the DPW posting on Facebook had a lot of information and it scared the potential applicant. Trustee Ciganick stated that the expression of appreciation to employees is something the Council can do that does not cost money. DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that the three-step pay scale is a good idea. He stated that the county and road commission have three-step pay scales. He stated that there needs to be more separation between maintenance staff and people with a water and/or sewer license. He reiterated that it does not have to be huge it can be \$1 more per license. Trustee Hardy stated that people who have been here longer should be making more. DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that is the government side. He stated that is the same at the county as well. Trustee Hardy stated that he is too used to the private sector. He stated that longevity should get someone more in their paycheck. General discussion was held about the past practices and how people doing the same job should be getting the same pay, and why the vacation time increases with longevity. Clerk Essad explained how the cost-of-living raises were done so that everyone would get the same amount of cost-of-living increase. General discussion was held about longevity being the vacation time and the pension plan. Treasurer Odom stated that the only thing to remember is that the Village must pay for the raises somehow, and the revenue does not increase like a business. She stated that if the Village cannot fund the raises but still wants to do it, then cuts need to be made. DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that he struggles when he sat through the rate study showing the Village does not have the money to do the projects required and rates need to go up but then the Village is going to turn around and give employees raises. General discussion was held about the water and sewer rates being raised. Trustee Ciganick stated that it is a perception thing because it is not all the same pot. Trustee Hardy stated that at least the Village can do the cost-of-living increase at 8.1%. Clerk Essad stated that normally the Village uses the CPI from December to December and the 8.1% was from August 2021 to August 2022. She stated that the December CPI would be out the second week of January. Chairperson Bennett suggested that the Village does more than one cost-of-living adjust per fiscal year. Treasurer Odom stated that would be hard to budget for. It was noted that one cost-of-living increase per year is easier to budget for.

- b. DPW Applicants:** The Committee reviewed 14 resumes received from the Indeed posting. DPW Supervisor Keiser narrowed it down to four he thought were qualified to be interviewed. Trustee Ciganick then stated his top picks for interviews. General discussion was held about the candidates to interview. It was the consensus of the Committee to interview Brett Newman, Jerry Wingo, and Emerson Root III. The Committee then discussed the applicants to send a “thank you but no thank you” letter

# Village of Bellaire

## ADMINISTRATION & PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

Dan Bennett, Chairman

Dave Ciganick

Bryan Hardy

to. It was the consensus of the Committee to send out 7 letters so far. General discussion was held about when to hold interviews.

- c. **Employee Feedback/Evals:** Trustee Hardy stated that the employee feedback he received was regarding the pay scale. He wanted to look at getting increases to everyone to cover inflation, but the Village must pay for improvements at the wastewater treatment plant. General discussion was held about how to evaluate employees and staff. Trustee Ciganick stated that the only person qualified to evaluate employees is the department head. Chief Drollinger asked about merit pay, because he thought that the entire point of the evaluations was to base merit pay off them. Trustee Ciganick stated that he did not see the Village doing merit pay this year. Chief Drollinger stated that the evaluations stay with the employee and other employers can ask for them. General discussion was held about the evaluations and open dialog with employees. Trustee Hardy asked about no doing the evaluations this year. DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that he thought that if evaluations were done it needs to be made very clear that there will be no merit pay. Trustee Hardy would like something written up in all employees' files regarding their performance. DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that he thinks that the evaluations need to be changed up from the way it has been the last couple years. Trustee Hardy stated that the evaluations were changed a couple years ago to fit better with the employee's job.

**Motion by Ciganick, seconded by Bennett to recommend to the Village Council that employee evaluations are done by the department heads and that the Council is responsible for only the evaluations of the four individuals that are here (Clerk, Treasurer, DPW Supervisor and Police Chief). Motion Passed by unanimous voice vote.**

### d. Handbook

- i. **Holiday Pay:** Clerk Essad stated that a question came up regarding holiday pay, and if employees get paid 8 hours or for however long their normal shift is on holidays. The Handbook does not address this as it states that the shifts are 8 hours. General discussion was held about if the employee should be paid 8 hours holiday pay or if the holiday pay should correlate to their shift. It was the consensus of the Committee to pay holiday pay based on the employee's shift.
- ii. **Vacation/PTO effect Overtime:** Treasurer Odom stated that when an employee takes paid leave time and it creates overtime, does the employee get the overtime or can the employee not use paid leave time to accrue overtime. General discussion was held about employees taking paid leave time and accruing overtime in the same work week. It was the consensus of the Committee to pay overtime for anything over 40 hours.

# Village of Bellaire

## ADMINISTRATION & PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

Dan Bennett, Chairman

Dave Ciganick

Bryan Hardy

**IX. Correspondence/Reports:** Clerk Essad stated that she will be on maternity leave/taking FMLA at the end of February into the new fiscal year, and she will have the paperwork to the Council in January. Trustee Ciganick worried about the burden it would place on Treasurer Odom and asked if there was anything that can be done to help her. Treasurer Odom stated that it has been done before and it can be done again. Chief Drollinger stated that a note on the door stating that the office is closed for lunch or that they have gone to the post office can be put up. Clerk Essad stated that those notes are used currently when there is only one person in the office.

DPW Supervisor Keiser stated that he will probably not be at the Council meeting because he has a football game that night.

**X. Member/Public Comment:** Chairperson Bennett asked DPW Supervisor Keiser to include in his report to Council an update on the wastewater. Chairperson Bennett stated that he is not getting any benefit from his township taxes and that Ray Mills' idea for Village to City may have some merit to it. Trustee Ciganick agreed. Treasurer Odom stated that she believes that it failed last time because the boundaries changed. General discussion was held about if the Village was a city, then the resident's taxes would ultimately go down slightly because of how much goes to the townships.

**XI. Adjourn:** The meeting was adjourned at 9:20 AM to the call of the chair.

Minutes compiled by:  
Nicole E. Essad, Clerk

**Minutes are subject to approval.**

**Approved:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Date:** \_\_\_\_\_